

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Minutes

December 14, 2006
Salisbury, North Carolina

The Historic Preservation Commission for the City of Salisbury met in regular session on Thursday, December 14, 2006, in the Council Chambers at the City Hall, 217 S. Main Street.

The meeting was called to order by the Chairman, Michael Young.

Oath of Office to New Member

Anne Waters was sworn in as a new member of the Commission by the chairman, Michael Young. She was welcomed by Commission members and seated.

Other members present were: Jack Errante, Raemi Evans, Susan Hurt, Anne Lyles and Wayne Whitman

Absent: Ronald Fleming and Judy Kandl

Michael Young welcomed all persons present and read the meeting's purpose and procedures.

Requests for Certificates of Appropriateness

H-39-04 130 E. Liberty St. – City of Salisbury, owner

Request: Revisions to previously approved lighting fixtures - **WITHDRAWN**

H-45-06 305 W. Thomas St. – Theodore & Mary Blanton, owner

Request: Replacement of wood garage door with steel door

Theodore Blanton was sworn in to give testimony for his request while staff presented slides.

Mr. Blanton testified that the existing wood garage door is deteriorating. He presented two options for the Commission's consideration: 1) as requested on the application: to replace with a steel door which looks very similar to his neighbor's door, or 2) to replace with an identical door to the existing. He stated that the preference for the metal door would be because it is lighter and maintenance free.

Michael Young read the description of the property as shown in the staff report which indicated that the shed is not new construction but rather a 1922 addition to the house.

Susan Hurt read the guidelines from the Design Guidelines - Chapter 2 Changes to Buildings – Garages and Outbuildings, pp. 22-23:

2. Retain and preserve all architectural features that are character-defining elements of garages and outbuildings, including foundations, steps, roof form, windows, doors, architectural trim, and lattices.
3. Retain and preserve historic garage and outbuilding materials, such as siding, masonry, roofing materials, and wooden trim. If replacement is necessary, use new materials that match the historic materials in composition, dimension, shape, color, pattern, and texture. Consider substitute materials only if the original materials are not technically feasible.
5. If replacement of an element or a detail is necessary, replace only the deteriorated item to match the original in size, scale, proportion, material, texture, and detail.

Jack Errante also read the following statements from the introduction to the Garages and Outbuildings guidelines:

A number of original garages and smaller outbuildings, and even a few carriage houses, survive in the historic district. Many echo the materials, the details, and the roof form of the main house on the site and contribute to the architectural character of the district. Through their siting and relationship to the houses, the streets, and the alleys, the accessory buildings contribute to the historic character of the district as well. Early garages were typically single-bay structures located in the rear yard at the end of the driveway.

In response to a question from the Chair, Mr. Blanton said he did not have any original photographs of the house.

Michael Young stated that a door similar to the picture shown on page 22 of the Design Guidelines would be acceptable.

Susan Hurt stated that she did not think a metal door for a 1920's garage was a good precedence for the neighborhood.

In response to Mr. Blanton who asked if an identical wooden door would be appropriate, Michael Young stated that per the guidelines, a wooden door in a design compatible with a 1920's architecture would be appropriate; therefore, the existing door would be an inappropriate style.

Michael Young suggested tabling the request until more research could be done on doors; however, Mr. Blanton stated that the existing door was falling apart so he would have a problem with tabling it for any length of time.

Wendy Spry stated that a wooden door from the 20's era could be approved as a minor work because it would be of similar material, rather than a change in material as was initially requested.

Susan Hurt suggested paraphrasing the description to "a wooden door not incompatible with is a 1920's style garage door."

She said, “You don’t have to replicate a 1920’s door because the building has been through a lot of changes but it shouldn’t be incompatible with the period in which the garage was built.” This way, she continued, Mr. Blanton would have more options.

She also agreed that it could be approved through minor works.

Mr. Blanton asked if the staff could give him examples of what would be appropriate, to which Michael Young responded, “Yes.” Wendy Spry stated that she would give Mr. Blanton a call to discuss compatible designs.

Susan Hurt made the following motion: “I move that the application be referred to the minor works committee with the stipulation that the applicant bring designs for a wooden door and that the HPC and staff provide the applicant with some examples of compatible wooden garage doors.”

Jack Errante seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

H-54-06 415 W. Marsh St. – Mary Arey, owner

Request: (1) Finish front of garage as described on attached
(2) Complete screen porch
(3) Add 8’x8’ deck off screen porch

Mary Arey was sworn to give testimony for the request, while staff presented slides.

Mrs. Arey informed the Commission that hardi-plank which was approved by the Commission in an earlier request to cover the gable over the front door was installed incorrectly and needs to be removed and installed correctly. In doing so, she would also like to match the general style of the gable for the garage using the same hardi-plank siding by extending the front gable of the garage to the edge of the roof. Coach lights would be installed on either side of the garage door matching those at the front door.

Michael Young read the guidelines from Chapter 2 Changes to Buildings – Garages and Outbuildings as follows:

2. Retain and preserve all architectural features that are character-defining elements of garages and outbuildings, including foundations, steps, roof form, windows, doors, architectural trim, and lattices.
3. Retain and preserve historic garage and outbuilding materials, such as siding, masonry, roofing materials, and wooden trim. If replacement is necessary, use new materials that match the historic materials in composition, dimension, shape, color, pattern, and texture. Consider substitute materials only if the original materials are not technically feasible.

In response to a question from the Chair, Mrs. Arey testified that she was not sure of the age of the garage addition but the mismatched brick is evidence that it was later than the house.

Mrs. Arey continued with testimony for the completion of a screen porch. The porch is framed in wood and will be painted.

Mrs. Arey testified that an 8 x 8 deck would be constructed on the west side of the porch. The deck floor will match the porch floor and the railings will be pressure treated lumber and later stained.

She informed the Commission that the person who will build the deck has recommended that the deck be extended all the way to the corner of the house with the stairs located on that corner rather than street front as shown on the submitted plan. She does agree with that recommendation, she said.

Michael Young read the following guideline from Chapter 2 Changes to Buildings – Porches, Entrances and Balconies

7. If a historic porch, entrance, or balcony is completely missing, replace it with either a reconstruction based on accurate documentation or a new design compatible with the historic character of the building in height, proportion, roof shape, material, texture, scale, detail, and color.

Mrs. Arey further testified that there are copper gutters on the front of the house; however, the previous owner had painted some of the gutters brown. She said white would match the trim on the house and she would like to replace all of the existing copper gutters with white aluminum guttering. She testified that white guttering has already been put up on the two room additions on the back of the house, sided white, because routing of the water was desperately needed.

In response to a question from Susan Hurt, Mrs. Arey stated that the downspouts and gutters on different areas on the front of the house have been painted brown. She also stated that the guttering was apparently damaged by trees that had fallen on the roof at some time, and not possible to repair.

With no other comments or questions from the Commission, and no one present to speak in support or opposition, the chairman called for a motion.

Susan Hurt made the motion as follows: “I move that the Commission find the following facts concerning Application #H-54-04 – that Steven & Mary, owner of 415 W. Marsh St., appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness to finish the front of garage by extending the front gable of the garage to the edge of the roof and using a plank similar to what has been previously approved, adding trim that is very consistent with what is around the front door of the house, completing a screen porch and adding an 8 ft. sq. deck that will extend to the end of the house with stairs on the back side, and replacing copper gutters with white aluminum guttering; that no one appeared before the Commission to support or oppose this request; this request should be granted based on The Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Chapter 2 – Changes to Buildings – Garages and Outbuildings, pages 22-23, guidelines 1-3, and 5-10, and Chapter 3 – New Construction – Additions, page 44-45, guidelines 1-11, and

Architectural Metals, page 29, guidelines 1-3 of The Residential Historic District Guidelines; mitigating factors include that the garage is an addition to the house and the way it is currently constructed the materials don't match and it will made to look more consistent with the main part of the house; other mitigating factors are that the copper gutters were painted brown by a previous owner and were damaged by trees falling on the roof and it has not been possible to repair them; therefore, I further move that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application #H-54-04 be granted to Steve & Mary Arey, owners of 415 W. Marsh St. to make the changes detailed in the application."

Anne Lyles seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

Other Business

HPC Goals

Janet Gapen presented a draft of new goals for 2007.

After viewing and discussing the proposed list of goals, and evaluation of the 2006 goals, Ms. Gapen asked that any suggestions for new goals be emailed to her. She stated that January 16th is the date for the HPC goal presentation to City Council; therefore, the goals should be finalized and voted on at the January meeting.

Ms. Gapen said a committee for Preservation Week will be set in January. Also at the January meeting, a draft will be presented on information she has gathered to develop guidelines for reviewing public art.

Michael Young announced that the North Carolina Downtown Development Association (NCDDA) meeting will be held in Morganton in January. Ms. Gapen said she would get the information to everyone concerning the registration.

Michael Young stated also that the National Trust Main Street meeting would be held in Seattle in March.

Adoption of 2007 meeting dates: Susan Hurt made a motion to adopt the meeting dates for 2007. Jack Errante seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

Committee Reports

Minor works: The minor work approvals were received as information as submitted.

Design Review Advisory Committee (DRAC) Michael Young informed the Commission that Chris McNeely, a home designer, has consented to be a member of DRAC. Other members are Karen Alexander, Chris Bradshaw, and Ed Norvell.

Michael Young made the motion to accept Chris McNeely as a DRAC member. Susan Hurt seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

Minutes

Michael Young made the motion to accept the minutes as presented. Susan Hurt seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

Adjournment

With no other business to come before the Commission the meeting was adjourned.

Michael Young, Chairman

Judy Jordan, Secretary